PHIL 4603: Metaphysics
Prof. Funkhouser
8/30/05
Shorter Paper Assignment

Write a short paper (approximately 5 to 7 pages) on one of the following two topics. Make sure your paper is typed, double-spaced, written in proper English, stapled, with the pages numbered. Do not bother with a lengthy introduction or any other irrelevancies—stick to the assigned topic.

1. Identity of Indiscernibles: Max Black’s character $B$ offers what he takes to be a counter-example to the Identity of Indiscernibles. Is it successful? Defend a position on this proposed counter-example, as well as on the Identity of Indiscernibles more generally. Is it true? If the spheres are distinct, what makes them two?

You may benefit from looking at the following three articles (or some others). You can track these down on your own. Or, for the Hughes and Zimmerman, you can simply email me and ask me to send you a PDF version by email attachment.


2. Necessity of Identity: Kripke argues that all object identities are necessary. Gibbard offers a counter-example (Goliath and Lumpl). Does the proposed counter-example succeed at validating contingent identity? Defend a position on this proposed counter-example, as well as the Necessity of Identity more generally. Are all object identities necessary?

The ambitious might benefit from reading Yablo’s “Identity, Essence and Indiscernibility”, also in our anthology.

Assignment Due Date: Thursday, September 22nd