

PHIL 4603: Metaphysics  
Prof. Funkhouser  
Paper Assignment

## Shorter Paper Assignment (200 points)

You are to write an approximately 5 to 7 page paper on the following topic. Your paper can be a bit shorter or longer, but I will not read past the 9th page (seriously). Do not bother with any background material — *simply launch into addressing the questions below*. Make sure your paper is typed, double-spaced, written in proper English, stapled, with the pages numbered.

**Paper Due Date:** Monday, September 17th, 2007

**Topic:** The Necessity of Identity

Kripke argues that all object identities are necessary. Gibbard offers a counter-example (Goliath and Lump1). Does the proposed counter-example succeed at disproving Kripke's claim? Defend a position on this proposed counter-example, as well as the supposed necessity of identity more generally. Are all object identities necessary?

Our readings from Black, Kripke, Perry, and Gibbard should provide you with enough material to answer these questions. But, the ambitious might benefit from reading Yablo's "Identity, Essence and Indiscernibility", also in our anthology.